

## ***Journal of Optical Society of America A (JOSA A)***

### ***Discussion Paper Review Criteria***

The *Journal of the Optical Society of America A* (JOSA A) is devoted to developments in any field of classical optics, image science, and vision. JOSA A includes original peer-reviewed papers including, but not limited to: atmospheric optics, clinical vision, color, diffraction and gratings, image processing, machine vision, physiological optics, polarization, scattering and coherence theory, signal processing, statistical optics, thin films, and visual optics. JOSA A publishes several special paper types, including discussion papers, mini-reviews, and tutorials.

A discussion paper should provide the community with valuable observations and discussion that might not fit neatly into a normal research paper. Discussion papers are subjected to critical review according to the criteria listed below.

#### **Quality of Scientific/Technical Content**

Rather than novelty of results, reviewers should consider whether the discussion paper provides valuable observations and discussion that is outside the scope of a standard research paper. The following questions should be considered: Is the discussion of current interest to optics researchers? Does it raise awareness about important but neglected findings? Does it provide a scholarly overview of the material? Are the conclusions supported by the data presented, and is the work placed in proper context? Does the discussion serve as a material reference for future work? Will the paper contribute positively to work in the optics and imaging community?

***Rating Options: Very high, High, Moderate, Low, Very low***

#### **Quality of Presentation**

Is the title accurate and does it clearly identify the subject matter? Is the abstract succinct and comprehensible to a non-specialist? Is the manuscript clearly written and logically organized? Are figures and tables understandable and readable as submitted, including all captions and labels? Is the quality of English language usage and grammar appropriate for an archival journal? If there is supplemental material, is it clearly presented and does it contribute to presentation?

***Rating Options: Very high, High, Moderate, Low, Very low***

#### **Appropriateness for JOSA A**

Does the subject matter fit within the scope of the journal? Will the paper be of interest to the optics community?

***Rating Options: Very high, High, Moderate, Low, Very low***

#### **Overall Impact**

Reviewers are asked to rate the overall impact of submitted papers assuming appropriate revisions are made. How likely is this paper to make a major impact on the research field covered? Discussion papers can make an impact by enabling new applications, by solving important problems, by providing new theoretical insights, or by presenting clear methods, procedures, or reviews to help other researchers perform similar work.

***Rating Options: Very high, High, Moderate, Low, Very low***